

RECEIVED

OFFICE OF PUBLIC ACCOUNTABILITY
PROCUREMENT APPEALS

Appendix A: Notice of Appeal Form
PROCUREMENT APPEAL DATE:___

Nov 26, 2018

	PART I- To be completed by OPA	FILE NO OPA-PA: DESCRIPTION BY: FOU
	In the Appeal of) NOT	ICE OF APPEAL
	Micronesia Renewable Energy Tuc) (Name of Company), APPELLANT) Dock	et No. OPA-PA 18-007
·•••••	PART II- Appellant Information	
	Name: Mailing Address: Micronesia Renewab P.O. Box 7810 Tamuning, GU 96931 167B E.T. Calvo Memo Tamuning, GU 96913	
	Email Address: Daytime Contact No: Fax No.: Tamuning, GU 96913 100-632-2613 647-8035	14 Rewabied iel 47.0011
	PART III- Appeal Information	
	A) Purchasing Agency: Department of Public Works	
	B) Identification/Number of Procurement, Solicitation, or Contract: Project No. 200-5-1041-	
	C) Decision being appealed was made on 1/14/18 Chief Procurement Officer Director of Public W	
	Note: You must serve the Agency checked here with a copfiling.	y of this Appeal within 24 hours of
	D) Appeal is made from: (Please select one and attach a copy of the Decision to thi Decision on Protest of Method, Solicitation or Awar Decision on Debarment or Suspension Decision on Contract or Breach of Contract Controv (Excluding claims of money owed to or by the gov Determination on Award not Stayed Pending Protest (Agency decision that award pending protest or approximately interests of the government of Guam)	ersy ernment) or Appeal

PART IV- Form and Filing In addition to this form, the Rules of Procedure for Procurement Appeals require the subtogether with this form of additional information, including BUT NOT LIMITED TO: 1. A concise, logically arranged, and direct statement of the grounds for appeal and the ruling requested; 3. Supporting exhibits, evidence, or documents to substantiate any claims an grounds for appeal unless not available within the filing time in which case expected availability date shall be indicated. Note: Please refer to 2 GAR § 12104 for the full text of filing requirements. PART V- Declaration Re Court Action Pursuant to 5 GCA Chapter 5, unless the court requests, expects, or otherwise expresses in a decision by the Public Auditor, the Office of Public Accountability will not take a any appeal where action concerning the protest or appeal has commenced in any court. The undersigned party does hereby confirm that to the best of his or her knowledge, no action concerning the subject of this Appeal has been commenced in court. All par required to and the undersigned party agrees to notify the Office of Public Accountability 24 hours if court action commences regarding this Appeal or the underlying procurement. Submitted this day of New 2016.	
In addition to this form, the Rules of Procedure for Procurement Appeals require the subt together with this form of additional information, including BUT NOT LIMITED TO: 1. A concise, logically arranged, and direct statement of the grounds for appeal 2. A statement specifying the ruling requested; 3. Supporting exhibits, evidence, or documents to substantiate any claims an grounds for appeal unless not available within the filing time in which case expected availability date shall be indicated. Note: Please refer to 2 GAR § 12104 for the full text of filing requirements. PART V- Declaration Re Court Action Pursuant to 5 GCA Chapter 5, unless the court requests, expects, or otherwise expresses in a decision by the Public Auditor, the Office of Public Accountability will not take a any appeal where action concerning the protest or appeal has commenced in any court. The undersigned party does hereby confirm that to the best of his or her knowledge, no action concerning the subject of this Appeal has been commenced in court. All par required to and the undersigned party agrees to notify the Office of Public Accountability 24 hours if court action commences regarding this Appeal or the underlying procurement. Submitted this day of New 2018.	
In addition to this form, the Rules of Procedure for Procurement Appeals require the subt together with this form of additional information, including BUT NOT LIMITED TO: 1. A concise, logically arranged, and direct statement of the grounds for appeal 2. A statement specifying the ruling requested; 3. Supporting exhibits, evidence, or documents to substantiate any claims an grounds for appeal unless not available within the filing time in which case expected availability date shall be indicated. Note: Please refer to 2 GAR § 12104 for the full text of filing requirements. PART V- Declaration Re Court Action Pursuant to 5 GCA Chapter 5, unless the court requests, expects, or otherwise expresses in a decision by the Public Auditor, the Office of Public Accountability will not take a any appeal where action concerning the protest or appeal has commenced in any court. The undersigned party does hereby confirm that to the best of his or her knowledge, no action concerning the subject of this Appeal has been commenced in court. All par required to and the undersigned party agrees to notify the Office of Public Accountability 24 hours if court action commences regarding this Appeal or the underlying procurement. Submitted this day of New 2018.	
In addition to this form, the Rules of Procedure for Procurement Appeals require the subt together with this form of additional information, including BUT NOT LIMITED TO: 1. A concise, logically arranged, and direct statement of the grounds for appeal 2. A statement specifying the ruling requested; 3. Supporting exhibits, evidence, or documents to substantiate any claims an grounds for appeal unless not available within the filing time in which case expected availability date shall be indicated. Note: Please refer to 2 GAR § 12104 for the full text of filing requirements. PART V- Declaration Re Court Action Pursuant to 5 GCA Chapter 5, unless the court requests, expects, or otherwise expresses in a decision by the Public Auditor, the Office of Public Accountability will not take a any appeal where action concerning the protest or appeal has commenced in any court. The undersigned party does hereby confirm that to the best of his or her knowledge, no action concerning the subject of this Appeal has been commenced in court. All par required to and the undersigned party agrees to notify the Office of Public Accountability 24 hours if court action commences regarding this Appeal or the underlying procurement. Submitted this day of New 2018.	
In addition to this form, the Rules of Procedure for Procurement Appeals require the subt together with this form of additional information, including BUT NOT LIMITED TO: 1. A concise, logically arranged, and direct statement of the grounds for appeal 2. A statement specifying the ruling requested; 3. Supporting exhibits, evidence, or documents to substantiate any claims an grounds for appeal unless not available within the filing time in which case expected availability date shall be indicated. Note: Please refer to 2 GAR § 12104 for the full text of filing requirements. PART V- Declaration Re Court Action Pursuant to 5 GCA Chapter 5, unless the court requests, expects, or otherwise expresses in a decision by the Public Auditor, the Office of Public Accountability will not take a any appeal where action concerning the protest or appeal has commenced in any court. The undersigned party does hereby confirm that to the best of his or her knowledge, no action concerning the subject of this Appeal has been commenced in court. All par required to and the undersigned party agrees to notify the Office of Public Accountability 24 hours if court action commences regarding this Appeal or the underlying procurement. Submitted this day of New 2018.	
1. A concise, logically arranged, and direct statement of the grounds for apper 2. A statement specifying the ruling requested; 3. Supporting exhibits, evidence, or documents to substantiate any claims an grounds for appeal unless not available within the filing time in which case expected availability date shall be indicated. Note: Please refer to 2 GAR § 12104 for the full text of filing requirements. PART V- Declaration Re Court Action Pursuant to 5 GCA Chapter 5, unless the court requests, expects, or otherwise expresses in a decision by the Public Auditor, the Office of Public Accountability will not take a any appeal where action concerning the protest or appeal has commenced in any court. The undersigned party does hereby confirm that to the best of his or her knowledge, no action concerning the subject of this Appeal has been commenced in court. All parequired to and the undersigned party agrees to notify the Office of Public Accountability 24 hours if court action commences regarding this Appeal or the underlying procurement. Submitted this day of low 2018.	***************************************
 2. A statement specifying the ruling requested; 3. Supporting exhibits, evidence, or documents to substantiate any claims an grounds for appeal unless not available within the filing time in which cas expected availability date shall be indicated. Note: Please refer to 2 GAR § 12104 for the full text of filing requirements. PART V- Declaration Re Court Action Pursuant to 5 GCA Chapter 5, unless the court requests, expects, or otherwise expresses in a decision by the Public Auditor, the Office of Public Accountability will not take a any appeal where action concerning the protest or appeal has commenced in any court. The undersigned party does hereby confirm that to the best of his or her knowledge, no action concerning the subject of this Appeal has been commenced in court. All parequired to and the undersigned party agrees to notify the Office of Public Accountability 24 hours if court action commences regarding this Appeal or the underlying procurement. Submitted thi ay of ay o	nission e
3. Supporting exhibits, evidence, or documents to substantiate any claims an grounds for appeal unless not available within the filing time in which cas expected availability date shall be indicated. Note: Please refer to 2 GAR § 12104 for the full text of filing requirements. PART V- Declaration Re Court Action Pursuant to 5 GCA Chapter 5, unless the court requests, expects, or otherwise expresses in a decision by the Public Auditor, the Office of Public Accountability will not take a any appeal where action concerning the protest or appeal has commenced in any court. The undersigned party does hereby confirm that to the best of his or her knowledge, no action concerning the subject of this Appeal has been commenced in court. All par required to and the undersigned party agrees to notify the Office of Public Accountability 24 hours if court action commences regarding this Appeal or the underlying procurement. Submitted this C day of Nov 2016.	al;
PART V- Declaration Re Court Action Pursuant to 5 GCA Chapter 5, unless the court requests, expects, or otherwise expresses in a decision by the Public Auditor, the Office of Public Accountability will not take a any appeal where action concerning the protest or appeal has commenced in any court. The undersigned party does hereby confirm that to the best of his or her knowledge, no action concerning the subject of this Appeal has been commenced in court. All parequired to and the undersigned party agrees to notify the Office of Public Accountability 24 hours if court action commences regarding this Appeal or the underlying procurements.	
PART V- Declaration Re Court Action Pursuant to 5 GCA Chapter 5, unless the court requests, expects, or otherwise expresses in a decision by the Public Auditor, the Office of Public Accountability will not take a any appeal where action concerning the protest or appeal has commenced in any court. The undersigned party does hereby confirm that to the best of his or her knowledge, no action concerning the subject of this Appeal has been commenced in court. All parequired to and the undersigned party agrees to notify the Office of Public Accountability 24 hours if court action commences regarding this Appeal or the underlying procurements. Submitted this day of New 2016.	z tile
Pursuant to 5 GCA Chapter 5, unless the court requests, expects, or otherwise expresses in a decision by the Public Auditor, the Office of Public Accountability will not take a any appeal where action concerning the protest or appeal has commenced in any court. The undersigned party does hereby confirm that to the best of his or her knowledge, no action concerning the subject of this Appeal has been commenced in court. All parequired to and the undersigned party agrees to notify the Office of Public Accountability 24 hours if court action commences regarding this Appeal or the underlying procurements. Submitted this day of Nov 2018.	
in a decision by the Public Auditor, the Office of Public Accountability will not take a any appeal where action concerning the protest or appeal has commenced in any court. The undersigned party does hereby confirm that to the best of his or her knowledge, no action concerning the subject of this Appeal has been commenced in court. All parequired to and the undersigned party agrees to notify the Office of Public Accountability 24 hours if court action commences regarding this Appeal or the underlying procurement. Submitted this day of Nov 2018.	***************************************
action concerning the subject of this Appeal has been commenced in court. All parequired to and the undersigned party agrees to notify the Office of Public Accountability 24 hours if court action commences regarding this Appeal or the underlying procurement. Submitted this day of Nov 2018.	interest ction on
	rties are y within
By	
Or APPELLANTI Otedo COO MIRE	
By:	
Appellant's Duly Authorized Representative (Address)	
(Phone No.)	

APPENDIX A



Appendix B: Declaration Form PROCUREMENT APPEAL

OFFICE OF PUBLIC ACCOUNTABILI

!	PROCUREMENT APPEALS	•
DATE	Nov 24,2018	

	TIME: 11:25 AM CIPM BY: FO	
	FILE NO OPA-PA: 18-0	٥7
In the Appeal of)	
))	
(Name of Company), APPELLANT	Docket No. OPA-PA 18-007	
)	

MICRONESIA RENEWABLE ENERGY, INC.

DECLARATION RE COURT ACTION

(To be signed by the Government Purchasing Agency.)

Pursuant to 5 GCA Chapter 5, unless the court requests, expects, or otherwise expresses interest in a decision by the Public Auditor, the Office of Public Accountability will not take action on any appeal where action concerning the protest or appeal has commenced in any court.

The undersigned party does hereby confirm that to the best of his or her knowledge, no case or action concerning the subject of this Appeal has been commenced in court. All parties are required to and the undersigned party agrees to notify the Office of Public Accountability within 24 hours if court action commences regarding this Appeal or the underlying procurement action.

Submitted this day of, 20	•
By: DECLARANT	
Print Declarant's Name	

APPENDIX B



RECEIVED OFFICE OF PUBLIC ACCOUNTABILITY PROCUREMENT APPEALS

Appendix C: Notice of Hearing FormE: Nov 26, 2018

PROCUREMENT APPEAL

PROCUREME	NT APPEAL TIME: 11:25 DAM DPM BY: FO
	FILE NO OPA-PA: 18-007
In the Appeal of)	NOTICE OF HEARING
(Name of Company), APPELLANT	Docket No.: OPA-PA_18-007
MICROHESIA RENEWABLE) EHERGY, INC.	
You are hereby notified that a hearing will Hearings Officer for Procurement Appeals a, day of, 20, at the hour of Procurement Appeal. You may be present represented by counsel; may present any reopportunity to cross-examine all witnesses tes issuance of subpoenas to compel the attendance documents or other things by applying to the I Office of Public Accountability.	at the Office of Public Accountability on, relative to the above-referenced at the hearing; may be, but need not be, elevant evidence; and will be given full tifying against you. You are entitled to the e of witnesses and the production of books.
Please acknowledge receipt of this Notice Accountability immediately.	e and return to the Office of Public
Acknowledged receipt:	
Receiver's Signature	
Print Name	

APPENDIX C

Date



OFFICE OF PUBLIC ACCOUNTABILITY PROCUREMENT APPEALS

Appendix D: Hearing Request/Waiver Form
PROCUREMENT APPEAL
DATE:

	TIME: U: 25 MAM PM BY: FO
In the Appeal of) FILE NO OPA-PA: 18-007
) HEARING
(Name of Company), APPELLANT	Paul Paul Paul Paul Paul Paul Paul Paul
MICRONESIA RENEWABLE ENERGY, INC.	
Please select one:	•
Pursuant to 2 GAR § 12108(a), thearing on the appeal stated above.	he undersigned party does hereby request a
Pursuant to 2 GAR § 12108(a), the right to a hearing and is submitting hearing.	undersigned party does hereby waive his/her g the appeal stated above on record without a
Submitted this 26 day of Nov. , 20 18.	
By: (Please select one)	
✓ APPELLANT	
Chief Procurement Officer	
Director of Public Works	
Head of Purchasing Agency	
Colombia	- Derther Voxcolo COO
Signature	Print Name



Public Works Department 542 North Marine Corps Drive Tamuning, Guam 96913 Attn: Mr. Glenn Leon Guerrero

Dear Mr. Guerrero,

Please accept this letter as an official notice to protest the award of Project No: 200-5-1041-F-TAM. Our firm is protesting this award under the following conditions.

- 1.) Award to an unqualified, non-responsive bidder under the following conditions:
- a.) On the morning of the bid opening, our business development assistant Ms. Dorothy Shultice was there for the bid opening, she observed the following and this is her statement: "When I walked into the room, I saw John Calanayan and a tall guy with dark hair from Pacific Solar shuffling through papers. When John saw me, he turned around and came back with a sign in sheet for us to fill in. He then had us place our bids into a wooden box with a slot. Pacific Solar's was clipped together, whereas MRE's was in a vanilla sealed envelope, as I thought was required. When John opened the box, he commented that he would open mine first. He stepped back several feet to a desk where another gentleman was writing the amounts he was reading to him. Then he did the same for Pacific Solar's unsealed bid.". This is clearly not allowable under the Guam Procurement regulations. As stated in the Invitation for Bid and the Instructions to Bidders, receipt and Opening of Bids, Sealed bids in duplicate enclosed in a sealed envelope were to be submitted, this was clearly a violation of Guam Procurement Law.
- b.) Pacific Solar and Photovoltaic was clearly lower in price than Micronesia Renewable Energy, Inc. but what is the Government of Guam getting for this capital outlay. MRE clearly stated the sizing of the system that we would provide for the price submitted, after numerous attempts to get this question answered we have not been able to. I believe this is a major disservice to the community of

<u>Mailing Address:</u> PO Box 7810, Tamuning Guam 96931 <u>Physical Address:</u> 167B E.T. Calvo Memorial Pkwy Tamuning, Guam 96913



RENEWABLE ENERGY INC.

Guam, it would be like placing a bid out for an automobile and taking the lowest bid without knowing what kind of car you are getting.

I am available to discuss this at your convenience, but I believe this project was awarded to a bidder that was non-responsive and this needs to be investigated.

Thank you,

Jeffrey Voacolo

Chief Operations Officer

Micronesia Renewable Energy, Inc.



DIEDIC WOTES
DIPATIAMENTON CHICAGO PUPPLEKO
GLENN LEON GUERRERO
Director
ANDREW LEON GUERRERO
Deputy Director

Draft - 10-01-2018

Jeffrey Voacolo Chief Operations Officer Micronesia Renewable Energy, Inc. 167B E.T. Calvo Memorial Tkwy Tamuning, Guam 96913

Re: Notice of Protest - Project No. 200-5-1041-F-Tam

Mr. Voacolo:

This serves to respond to Micronesia Renewable Energy, Inc.'s ("MRE") protest in the above matter as set forth in your letter of September 19, 2018. MRE's protest does not specifically state how the alleged violations are to be rectified but instead states that it is available to discuss the procurement. For the reasons stated herein the Department of Public Works ("DPW") Contracting Officer has determined that Protestor's written protest is without merit and is therefore denied.

MRE's first claim is that Pacific Solar & Photovoltaics, Inc. ("PSP") bid was "clipped together" in violation of the Guam Procurement regulations and the IFB's Instructions to Bidders. This claim is not factually correct. Similar to MRE, PSP's bid was submitted, in duplicate, in a vanilla sealed envelope. Enclosed is a copy of DPW's receipted copy of PSP's sealed bid. It appears your staff members reference to the "shuffling of papers" related to DPW's tabulation and sign in sheet.

MRE also claims that PSP's bid was "clearly lower in price than Micronesia Renewable Energy, Inc. but what is the Government of Guam getting for this capital outlay." It isn't clear, based on this and other related comments in MRE's protest, what the grounds are for MRE's second protest. While DPW appreciates that MRE believes its product to be superior to PSP, the department is obligated by law to award the contract to the lowest responsible bidder whose bid meets the requirements and criteria set forth in the IFB. See, 5 GCA § 5211(g). DPW Capital Improvement Project's Bid Evaluation and Tabulation sheets, copies of which are enclosed herewith, both document that PSP met the IFB's terms and conditions. As such, DPW correctly awarded the contract to PSP being the lowest responsible bidder who met the requirements and criteria of the IFB.

/// /// /// This is a final decision of the Contracting Office concerning MRE's September 19, 2018 protest of the above referenced IFB. You are hereby advised that MRE has the right to seek any administrative or judicial review authorized by law. If MRE appeals to the Office of Public Accountability ("OPA") such must be filed within fifteen (15) days of this notice of final decision. See, 5 GCA M 5425(e).

Please contact me if you have any questions.

GLENNLEON GUERRERO
Director