Suite 401 DNA Building 238 Archbishop Flores St. Hagåtña, Guam 96910





	Mr. Glenn Leon Guerrero Director Department of Public Works 542 North Marine Corps Drive Tamuning, Guam 96913 Fax: (671) 649-6178		From:	Benjamin J.F. Cruz Guam Public Auditor Office of Public Accountability
To:			Pages:	9 (including cover page)
	Mr. Jeffrey Voac Chief Operations Micronesia Renew	Officer	Date:	November 27, 2018
CC:	Mailing address: P.O. Box 7810 Tamuning, Guam Physical address: 167B E.T. Calvo M Tamuning, Guam Phone: (671) 632- Fax: (671) 647-80	Memorial Parkway 96913 2613	Phone: Fax:	(671) 475-0390 x. 209 (671) 472-7951
Re:	OPA-PA-18-007 I	Notice of Appeal		
□ Urgent	☐ For Review	☐ Please Comment	→ Please Repl	y 🗆 Please Recycle
Comments:				
	owledge receipt of the p, date, and initials of		this cover page a	along with your firm or agency's
			Thank	you,
			Frederi	ick Jones
			Accour	ntability Auditor I
			fjones (	@guamopa.com

This facsimile transmission and accompanying documents may contain confidential or privileged information. If you are not the intended recipient of this fax transmission, please call our office and notify us immediately. Do not distribute or disclose the contents to anyone. Thank you.

### OFFICE OF PUBLIC ACCOUNTABILTY



Suite 401 Pacific News Building, 238 Archbishop Flores St., Hagåtña, Guam 96910 Phone: (671) 475-0390 / FAX: (671) 472-7951

November 27, 2018

Mr. Glenn Leon Guerrero Director Department of Public Works 542 North Marine Corps Drive Tamuning, Guam 96913

VIA FACSIMILE: 649-6178

Re: Notice of Receipt of Appeal – OPA-PA-18-007

Dear Mr. Leon Guerrero,

Please be advised that Micronesia Renewable Energy (hereinafter referred to as "MRE") filed an appeal with the Office of Public Accountability (OPA) on November 26, 2018, regarding the Department of Public Work (DPW)'s response to MRE's protest relative to the procurement award Project No. 200-5-1041-F-TAM: DPW Capital Improvement Project. OPA has assigned this appeal case number OPA-PA-18-007.

Immediate action is required of DPW pursuant to the Rules of Procedure for Procurement Appeals, found in Chapter 12 of the Guam Administrative Regulations (GAR). Copies of the rules, the appeal, and all filing deadlines are available at OPA's office and on its website at <a href="https://www.opaguam.org">www.opaguam.org</a>. The first two pages of the notice of appeal filed with OPA is enclosed for your reference.

Please provide the required notice of this appeal to the relative parties with instructions that they should communicate directly with OPA regarding the appeals. You are also responsible for giving notice to the Attorney General or other legal counsel for your agency. Promptly provide OPA with the identities and addresses of interested parties and a formal entry of appearance by your legal counsel.

Pursuant to 2 GAR, Div. 4, Ch. 12, §12104(3), the submission of one complete copy of the procurement record for the procurement solicitation above, as outlined in Title 5, Chapter 5, §5249 of the Guam Code Annotated is required no later than **Tuesday, December 4, 2018**, five work days following this Notice of Receipt of Appeal. We also request one copy of the Agency Report for each of the procurement solicitations cited above, as outlined in 2 GAR, Div. 4, Chap. 12, §12105, by **Wednesday, December 12, 2018**, ten work days following receipt of this notice.

When filing all other required documents with our office, please provide one original and two copies to OPA, and serve a copy to MRE. Although the Guam Procurement Law and Regulations

require only one copy of the procurement record, OPA respectfully asks that DPW provide one original and two copies of the said record, which will be distributed as follows: Copy-1: Master File; Copy-2: Public Auditor; and Copy-3: Hearing Officer.

Thank you for your prompt attention to this matter. Please contact Frederick Jones at 475-0390 ext. 207 or fjones@guamopa.com should you have any questions regarding this notice.

Sincerely,

Benjamin J.F. Cruz Public Auditor

Enclosure: First 6 Pages of the Notice of Appeal – OPA-PA-18-007

Cc: Jeffrey Voacolo, Chief Operations Officer for Appellant MRE



### RECEIVED

OFFICE OF PUBLIC ACCOUNTABILITY PROCUREMENT APPEALS

Appendix A: Notice of Appeal Form

PROCUREMENT APPEAL DATE:\_\_\_

Nov 26, 2018

	PART I- To be completed by OPA	FILE NO OPA-PA: BY: PBC 18-007
	In the Appeal of  Micronesia Renewable Energy Troc  (Name of Company), APPELLANT  )	NOTICE OF APPEAL  Docket No. OPA-PA  18-007
******	PART II- Appellant Information	
	Business Address:    P.O. Box 7810   Tamuning, GU   GI	enewable Energy, Inc.  96931 10 Memorial Parkway 196913 120nesiarenewableenergy.com 12:487-3763
•••••	PART III- Appeal Information	
	A) Purchasing Agency: Department	of Public Works
		licitation, or Contract: Project No. 200-5-1041- 14/18 (date) by: r of Public Works Head of Purchasing Agency
		r of Public Works Head of Purchasting Agency
	D) Appeal is made from:  (Please select one and attach a copy of the De  Decision on Protest of Method, Solicitat  Decision on Debarment or Suspension  Decision on Contract or Breach of Cont  (Excluding claims of money owed to or  Determination on Award not Stayed Pen  (Agency decision that award pending processes of the government)	tion or Award  cract Controversy or by the government) ading Protest or Appeal protest or appeal was necessary to protect the

	E) Names of Competing Bidders, Offerors, or Contractors known to Appellant:
e de	
	PART IV- Form and Filing
	In addition to this form, the Rules of Procedure for Procurement Appeals require the submission together with this form of additional information, including BUT NOT LIMITED TO:
	<ol> <li>A concise, logically arranged, and direct statement of the grounds for appeal;</li> <li>A statement specifying the ruling requested;</li> </ol>
	<ol> <li>Supporting exhibits, evidence, or documents to substantiate any claims and the grounds for appeal unless not available within the filing time in which case the expected availability date shall be indicated.</li> </ol>
	Note: Please refer to 2 GAR $\S$ 12104 for the full text of filing requirements.
	PART V- Declaration Re Court Action
	Pursuant to 5 GCA Chapter 5, unless the court requests, expects, or otherwise expresses interest in a decision by the Public Auditor, the Office of Public Accountability will not take action on any appeal where action concerning the protest or appeal has commenced in any court.
	The undersigned party does hereby confirm that to the best of his or her knowledge, no case or action concerning the subject of this Appeal has been commenced in court. All parties are required to and the undersigned party agrees to notify the Office of Public Accountability within 24 hours if court action commences regarding this Appeal or the underlying procurement action.
	Submitted this day of Nov 2018.
_	By
	OF APPELLANT Obedo COO MIZE
	By:
	Appellant's Duly Authorized Representative (Address)
	(Phone No.)

APPENDIX A



## Appendix B: Declaration Form PROCUREMENT APPEAL

OFFICE OF PUBLIC ACCOUNTABILITY
PROCUREMENT APPEALS

PROCI	UREMENT APPEAL	
	CHEMENT ATTEAL	DATE: Nov 26,2018
		TIME: 11:25 AAM CIPM BY: FOU
		FILE NO OPA-PA: 28 -00
In the Appeal of	)	,
(Name of Company), APPELLANT	) ) Docket 1	No. OPA-PA 18-007
MICRONESIA REMEWA ENERGY INC.	4BLE	

### DECLARATION RE COURT ACTION

(To be signed by the Government Purchasing Agency.)

Pursuant to 5 GCA Chapter 5, unless the court requests, expects, or otherwise expresses interest in a decision by the Public Auditor, the Office of Public Accountability will not take action on any appeal where action concerning the protest or appeal has commenced in any court.

The undersigned party does hereby confirm that to the best of his or her knowledge, no case or action concerning the subject of this Appeal has been commenced in court. All parties are required to and the undersigned party agrees to notify the Office of Public Accountability within 24 hours if court action commences regarding this Appeal or the underlying procurement action.

Subm	itted this day of, 20
Ву:	DECLARANT
	DECLARANT
-	Print Declarant's Name

APPENDIX B



# RECEIVED OFFICE OF PUBLIC ACCOUNTABILITY PROCUREMENT APPEALS

Appendix C: Notice of Hearing FormE: Nov 26, 2018

PROCUREMENT APPEAL

TIME: 11:25 MAM CIPM BY: FOL

TROCOR	TIME: 11:25 NAM CIPM BY: FO
	FILE NO OPA-PA: 18-00
In the Appeal of	) ) NOTICE OF HEARING
(Name of Company), APPELLANT	) Docket No.: OPA-PA_18-007
MICRONESIA RENEWAS ENERGY, INC.	<u> </u>
Please acknowledge receipt of this N	will be held before the Public Auditor or the eals at the Office of Public Accountability on ur of, relative to the above-referenced sent at the hearing; may be, but need not be, ny relevant evidence; and will be given full es testifying against you. You are entitled to the adance of witnesses and the production of books, the Hearings Officer for Procurement Appeals,
Accountability immediately.  Acknowledged receipt:	
Receiver's Signature	
Print Name	
Notes	

APPENDIX C



RECEIVED
OFFICE OF PUBLIC ACCOUNTABILITY
PROCUREMENT APPEALS

Appendix D: Hearing Request/Waiver Form PROCUREMENT APPEAL DATE:

DATE: Nov 26,2018

	TIME: 11:25 XAM CIPM BY: FO
In the Appeal of	FILE NO OPA-PA: 18-00
· ·	) HEARING ) REQUEST/WAIVER
(Name of Company), APPELLANT	Docket No. OPA-PA 18-007
MICRONESIA RENEWABLE ENERGY, INC.	
Please select one:	•
Pursuant to 2 GAR § 12108(a), hearing on the appeal stated above	the undersigned party does hereby request a
Pursuant to 2 GAR § 12108(a), the right to a hearing and is submitting the hearing.	he undersigned party does hereby waive his/her ng the appeal stated above on record without a
Submitted this <b>26</b> day of <b>Nov.</b> , 20 18.	
By: (Please select one)	
✓ APPELLANT	
Chief Procurement Officer	
Director of Public Works	
Head of Purchasing Agency	
Signature	Print Name 11.25



Public Works Department 542 North Marine Corps Drive Tamuning, Guam 96913 Attn: Mr. Glenn Leon Guerrero

Dear Mr. Guerrero,

Please accept this letter as an official notice to protest the award of Project No: 200-5-1041-F-TAM. Our firm is protesting this award under the following conditions.

- 1.) Award to an unqualified, non-responsive bidder under the following conditions:
- a.) On the morning of the bid opening, our business development assistant Ms. Dorothy Shultice was there for the bid opening, she observed the following and this is her statement: "When I walked into the room, I saw John Calanayan and a tall guy with dark hair from Pacific Solar shuffling through papers. When John saw me, he turned around and came back with a sign in sheet for us to fill in. He then had us place our bids into a wooden box with a slot. Pacific Solar's was clipped together, whereas MRE's was in a vanilla sealed envelope, as I thought was required. When John opened the box, he commented that he would open mine first. He stepped back several feet to a desk where another gentleman was writing the amounts he was reading to him. Then he did the same for Pacific Solar's unsealed bid.". This is clearly not allowable under the Guam Procurement regulations. As stated in the Invitation for Bid and the Instructions to Bidders, receipt and Opening of Bids, Sealed bids in duplicate enclosed in a sealed envelope were to be submitted, this was clearly a violation of Guam Procurement Law.
- b.) Pacific Solar and Photovoltaic was clearly lower in price than Micronesia Renewable Energy, Inc. but what is the Government of Guam getting for this capital outlay. MRE clearly stated the sizing of the system that we would provide for the price submitted, after numerous attempts to get this question answered we have not been able to. I believe this is a major disservice to the community of

<u>Mailing Address:</u> PO Box 7810, Tamuning Guam 96931 <u>Physical Address:</u> 167B E.T. Calvo Memorial Pkwy Tamuning, Guam 96913



RENEWABLE ENERGY INC.

Guam, it would be like placing a bid out for an automobile and taking the lowest bid without knowing what kind of car you are getting.

I am available to discuss this at your convenience, but I believe this project was awarded to a bidder that was non-responsive and this needs to be investigated.

Ihank you,

Jeffrey Voacolo

**Chief Operations Officer** 

Micronesia Renewable Energy, Inc.



DUBLIC WOF CASE
DIPATTAMENTON CHECHOP PUPPLEXO
GLENN LEON GUERRERO
Director
ANDREW LEON GUERRERO
Deputy Director

### Draft - 10-01-2018

Jeffrey Voacolo Chief Operations Officer Micronesia Renewable Energy, Inc. 167B E.T. Calvo Memorial Tkwy Tamuning, Guam 96913

Re: Notice of Protest - Project No. 200-5-1041-F-Tam

Mr. Voacolo:

This serves to respond to Micronesia Renewable Energy, Inc.'s ("MRE") protest in the above matter as set forth in your letter of September 19, 2018. MRE's protest does not specifically state how the alleged violations are to be rectified but instead states that it is available to discuss the procurement. For the reasons stated herein the Department of Public Works ("DPW") Contracting Officer has determined that Protestor's written protest is without merit and is therefore denied.

MRE's first claim is that Pacific Solar & Photovoltaics, Inc. ("PSP") bid was "clipped together" in violation of the Guam Procurement regulations and the IFB's Instructions to Bidders. This claim is not factually correct. Similar to MRE, PSP's bid was submitted, in duplicate, in a vanilla sealed envelope. Enclosed is a copy of DPW's receipted copy of PSP's sealed bid. It appears your staff members reference to the "shuffling of papers" related to DPW's tabulation and sign in sheet.

MRE also claims that PSP's bid was "clearly lower in price than Micronesia Renewable Energy, Inc. but what is the Government of Guam getting for this capital outlay." It isn't clear, based on this and other related comments in MRE's protest, what the grounds are for MRE's second protest. While DPW appreciates that MRE believes its product to be superior to PSP, the department is obligated by law to award the contract to the lowest responsible bidder whose bid meets the requirements and criteria set forth in the IFB. See, 5 GCA § 5211(g). DPW Capital Improvement Project's Bid Evaluation and Tabulation sheets, copies of which are enclosed herewith, both document that PSP met the IFB's terms and conditions. As such, DPW correctly awarded the contract to PSP being the lowest responsible bidder who met the requirements and criteria of the IFB.

/// /// /// This is a final decision of the Contracting Office concerning MRE's September 19, 2018 protest of the above referenced IFB. You are hereby advised that MRE has the right to seek any administrative or judicial review authorized by law. If MRE appeals to the Office of Public Accountability ("OPA") such must be filed within fifteen (15) days of this notice of final decision. See, 5 GCA M 5425(e).

Please contact me if you have any questions.

### **Broadcast Report**

Date/Time Local ID 1

11-27-2018 6714727951

09:25:11 a.m.

Transmit Header Text Local Name 1

OFFICE OF THE PUBLIC AUDITOR

This document: Confirmed (reduced sample and details below)

Document size: 8.5"x11"

Suite 401 DNA Building 238 Archbishop Flores St. Hagâtña, Guam 96910



	Mr. Glenn Leon Guerrero Director Department of Public Works	From:	Benjamin J.F. Cruz Gunm Public Auditor Office of Public Accountability		
To:	542 North Marine Corps Drive Tamuning, Guam 96913 Fax: (671) 649-6178	Pages:	9 (including cover page)		
	Mr. Jeffrey Voacolo Chief Operations Officer Micronesia Renewable Energy, Inc.	Date:	November 27, 2018		
CC:	Mailing address: P.O. Box 7810 Tamuning, Guam 96913 Physical address: 167B E.T. Calva Memorial Parkway Tamuning, Guam 96913 Phone: (671) 632-2613 Fax: (671) 647-8035	Phone: Fax:	(671) 475-0390 x. 209 (671) 472-7951		

OPA-PA-18-007 Notice of Appeal Re: □ Urgent ☐ For Review ☐ Please Comment → Please Reply

☐ Please Recycle

Please acknowledge receipt of this transmittal by re-sending this cover page along with your firm or agency's receipt stamp, date, and initials of receiver.

> Thank you, Frederick Jones Accountability Auditor I fjunes@guamnpa.com

This facsimile transmission and accompanying documents may contain confidential or privileged information. If you are not the intended recipient of this fax transmission, please call our office and notify us immediately. Do not distribute or disclose the contents to anyone. Thank you.

Total Pages Scanned: 12

Total Pages Confirmed: 24

No.	Job	Remote Station	Start Time	Duration	Pages	Line	Mode	Job Type	Results
001	748	6716496178	09:08:44 a.m. 11–27–2018	00:02:57	12/12	1	EC	HS	CP14400
002	748	6716478035	09:08:44 a.m. 11–27–2018	00:04:27	12/12	1	EC	HS	CP14400

### Abbreviations:

HS: Host send HR: Host receive WS: Waiting send PL: Polled local

PR: Polled remote

MP: Mailbox print RP: Report

**CP: Completed** FA: Fail

TS: Terminated by system G3: Group 3

MS: Mailbox save FF: Fax Forward

TU: Terminated by user

EC: Error Correct

### **Transmission Report**

Date/Time Local ID 1

11-27-2018 6714727951

03:24:34 p.m.

Transmit Header Text Local Name 1

OFFICE OF THE PUBLIC AUDITOR

This document: Confirmed (reduced sample and details below)

Document size: 8.5"x11"

Suite 401 DNA Building 238 Archbishop Flores St. Hagåtña, Guam 96910



	Mr. Glenn Leon Guerrero Director Department of Public Works	From:	Benjamin J.F. Cruz Guam Public Auditor Office of Public Accountability	
To:	542 North Marine Corps Drive Tamuning, Guam 96913 Fax: (671) 649-6178	Pages	9 (including cover page)	
	Mr. Jeffrey Voacolo Chief Operations Officer Micronesia Renewable Energy, Inc.	Date:	November 27, 2018	
CC:	Mailing address: P.O. Box 7810 Tamuning, Guam 96913 Physical address: 167B E.T. Calvo Memorial Parkway Tamuning, Guam 96913 Phone: (671) 632-2613 Fax: (671) 647-8035	Phone: Fax:	(671) 475-0390 x. 209 (671) 472-7951	

OPA-PA-18-007 Notice of Appeal ☐ Urgent ☐ For Review ☐ Please Comment ☐ Please Recycle

Comments:

Please acknowledge receipt of this transmittal by re-sending this cover page along with your firm or agency's receipt stamp, date, and initials of receiver.

> Thank you, Frederick Jones Accountability Auditor I fjones@guamopa.com

This facsimile transmission and accompanying documents may contain confidential or privileged information. If you are not the intended recipient of this fax transmission, please call our office and notify us immediately. Do not distribute or disclose the contents to anyone. Thank you,

Total Pages Scanned: 12

**Total Pages Confirmed: 12** 

No.	Jop	Remote Station	Start Time	Duration	Pages	Line	Mode	Job Type	Results
001	751	6714722493	03:19:06 p.m. 11-27-2018	00:04:52	12/12	1	EC	HS	CP7200

Abbreviations:

HS: Host send HR: Host receive WS: Waiting send PL: Polled local PR: Polled remote MS: Mailbox save

MP: Mailbox print

FF: Fax Forward

RP: Report

FA: Fail

TU: Terminated by user

CP: Completed

TS: Terminated by system

G3: Group 3 EC: Error Correct

03:19:45 p.m.

11-27-2018

1/12

Suite 401 DNA Building 238 Archbishop Flores St. Hagåtña, Guam 96910



# **FAX**

	Mr. Glenn Leon Guerrero Director Department of Public Works	From:	Benjamin J.F. Cruz Guam Public Auditor Office of Public Accountability
To:	542 North Marine Corps Drive Tamuning, Guam 96913 Fax: (671) 649-6178	Pages:	9 (including cover page)
24.1	Mr. Jeffrey Voacolo		
	Chief Operations Officer Micronesia Renewable Energy, Inc.	Date:	November 27, 2018
CC:	Mailing address: P.O. Box 7810 Tamuning, Guam 96913 Physical address: 167B E.T. Calvo Memorial Parkway Tamuning, Guam 96913 Phone: (671) 632-2613 Fax: (671) 647-8035	Phone: Fax:	(671) 475-0390 x. 209 (671) 472-7951
Re:	OPA-PA-18-007 Notice of Appeal	I	1

Ke:	OFA-PA-10-00/ I	OFA-FA-16-007 Notice of Appeal					
□Urgent	☐ For Review	☐ Please Comment	✔ Plense Reply	□ Please Recycle	_		
<u></u>							

### Comments:

Please acknowledge receipt of this transmittal by re-sending this cover page along with your firm or agency's receipt stamp, date, and initials of receiver.



Thank you,

Frederick Jones

Accountability Auditor I

fjones@guamopa.com

This facsimile transmission and accompanying documents may contain confidential or privileged information. If you are not the intended recipient of this fax transmission, please call our office and notify us immediately. Do not distribute or disclose the contents to anyone. Thank you.

6714727951

09:09:22 a.m.

11-27-2018

1/12

Suite 401 DNA Building 238 Archbishop Flores St. Hagåtña, Guam 96910



# FAX

To:	Mr. Glenn Leon Guerrero Director Department of Public Works 542 North Marine Corps Drive	From:	Benjamin J.F. Cruz Guam Public Auditor Office of Public Accountability
	Tamuning, Guam 96913 Fax: (671) 649-6178	Pages:	9 (including cover page)
	Mr. Jeffrey Voacolo Chief Operations Officer Micronesia Renewable Energy, Inc.	Date:	November 27, 2018
CC:	Malting address: P.O. Box 7810 Tamuning, Guam 96913 Physical address: 167B E.T. Calvo Memorial Parkway Tamuning, Guam 96913 Phone: (671) 632-2613 Fax: (671) 647-8035	Phone: Fax:	(671) 475-0390 x. 209 (671) 472-7951
Re:	OPA-PA-18-007 Notice of Appeal		

		чонсе от Арреді		
□ Urgent	☐ For Review	□ Please Comment	✓ Please Reply	□ Please Recycle
Comments:				to I lease Recycle

Please acknowledge receipt of this transmittal by re-sending this cover page along with your firm or agency's receipt stamp, date, and initials of receiver.

Thank you,
Frederick Jones
Accountability Auditor I
fiones@guamopa.com

This facsimile transmission and accompanying documents may contain confidential or privileged information. If you are not the intended recipient of this fax transmission, please call our office and notify us immediately. Do not distribute or disclose the contents to anyone. Thank you.

NOV 27 2018

DPW

Director to 2007

Director's Office

is EFERNOR F. BORJ.