Suite 401 DNA Building 238 Archbishop Flores St. Hagåtña, Guam 96910



# **FAX**

	Mr. Glenn Leon Guerrero Director Department of Public Works 542 North Marine Corps Drive Upper Tumon, Guam 96913 Phone: (671)646-3121/3232 Fax: (671) 649-6178  Mr. Thomas Keeler Ms. Shannon Taitano Assistant Attorney Generals Office of the Attorney General of Guam 590 S. Marine Corps Drive, Suite 706 Tamuning, Guam, 96913 Fax: (671) 472-2493		From:	Doris Flores Brooks Guam Public Auditor Office of Public Accountability		
То:			Pages:	4 (including cover page)		
CC:	Joyce C.H. Tang, I (Attorney for Appe Civille & Tang, PL	llant Core Tech)	Date:	May 4, 2017		
	330 Hernan Cortez Avenue Suite 200 Hagatna, Guam 96910 Phone: (671) 472-8868/9 Fax: (671) 477-2511		Phone: Fax:	(671) 475-0390 x. 208 (671) 472-7951		
Re:	OPA-PA-17-001 De Expedited Decision		ng Agency's M	otion to Dismiss and Motion for		
□ Urgent	☐ For Review	☐ Please Comment	✓ Please Reply	Motion to Dismiss and Motion for		
Comments:						
Please acknow	wledge receipt of thi	is transmittal by re-sending thi	is cover page a	long with your firm or agency's		
receipt stamp	, date, and initials of	receiver.				
			Thank	•		
			Jerrick	Jerrick Hernandez		
			Auditor	•		
		jhernandez@guamopa.com				

This facsimile transmission and accompanying documents may contain confidential or privileged information. If you are not the intended recipient of this fax transmission, please call our office and notify us immediately. Do not distribute or disclose the contents to anyone. Thank you.



OFFICE OF PUBLIC ACCOUNTABILITY

Doris Flores Brooks, CPA, CGFM

Public Auditor

#### PROCUREMENT APPEALS

IN THE APPEAL OF,

APPEAL NO: OPA-PA-17-001

6

1

2

3

4

7

8

9

10

1.1

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

CORE TECH INTERNATIONAL CORP,

Appellant

DECISION AND ORDER RE PURCHASING AGENCY'S MOTION TO DISMISS AND MOTION FOR EXPEDITED DECISION

To: **Purchasing Agency:** 

Department of Public Works, Government of Guam C/O Thomas P. Keeler, Esq.
Assistant Attorney General
Office of the Attorney General of Guam
590 S. Marine Corps Drive, Suite 706
Tamuning, Guam, 96913
Facsimile: (671) 472-2493

Appellant:

Core Tech International Corp. (CTI) C/O Joyce C.A. Tang, Esq. 330 Hernan Cortez Ave., Suite 200 Hagåtña, Guam, 96910 Facsimile: (671) 477-2511

THIS MATTER, came before the Public Auditor on April 20, 2017 for a hearing on the Purchasing Agency's Motion to Dismiss and Motion for Expedited Decision. The Appellant was represented by Joyce C.A. Tang, Esq. Felix Benavente appeared on behalf of the Purchasing Agency, and was represented by Assistant Attorney General Thomas P. Keeler, Esq. After hearing the arguments of the parties and for good cause shown, the Public Auditor hereby FINDS and ORDERS the following:

1. The Public Auditor DENIES the Motion to Dismiss. Every appellate tribunal has a duty to decide actual controversies by a judgment which can be carried into effect, and not to give opinions on moot questions, or abstract propositions, or to declare principles of rules of law which cannot affect the matter in issue in the case before it. *In Re Guardianship of Ulloa*, 2014

25

26

27

28

Guam 32, ¶24. A claim is moot when issues no longer live or the parties lack a legally cognizable legal interest in the outcome. Id., at ¶25. Accordingly, an appeal should be dismissed as moot when, by virtue of an intervening event, the appellate tribunal cannot grant effective relief whatever in favor of the appellant. *Id.* Further, a case can become most at any stage of litigation. Id., at ¶26. On the other hand, a case is not moot if the appellate tribunal has the ability to undo the effects of conduct that was not prevented by the time of decision. Sananap, et.al., v. Cyfred Ltd., et.al., 2009 Guam 13, ¶21. Finally, even if a mootness issue is not raised by the parties, an appellate tribunal is required to raise it sua sponte to examine jurisdictional issues. In Re Guardianship of Ulloa, 2014 Guam 32, ¶27. The Public Auditor's jurisdiction in this matter is based on her authority to review appeals of a Purchasing Agency's decision denying a procurement protest. 5 G.C.A. §5425(e) and 2 G.A.R. Div. 4, Chap. 12, §12112. In exercising this jurisdiction, the Public Auditor shall determine whether a decision on the protest concerning the method of solicitation, solicitation, or award of the contract, or entitlement to costs, is in accordance with the statutes, regulations, and the terms and conditions of the solicitation. 2 G.A.R. Div. 4, Chap. 12, §12112. The Public Auditor shall have the power to review and determine de novo any such appeals properly submitted to her. 5 G.C.A. §5703 and 2 G.A.R. Div. 4, Chap. 12, §12103(a). Accordingly, the Public Auditor finds that if this matter is moot due to the Purchasing Agency's concessions, it would not properly be before her because there would no longer be any issues regarding the Purchasing Agency's decision on the Appellant's protest concerning the method of solicitation, solicitation, or award of the contract, or entitlement to costs for the Public Auditor to review de novo. Here, the Purchasing Agency has agreed to limit the Request for Proposal at issue in this matter to the Simon Sanchez High School (hereafter referred to as "SSHS") Project and the preparation of the Comprehensive Capital Improvement Plan (hereafter referred to as "CCIP") for prioritizing capital improvements for the Guam Department of Education's remaining thirty-four (34) public schools. Page 3, Agency Report filed on March 31, 2017. To resolve whether this matter is now moot, the Public Auditor must determine whether the Purchasing Agency's concessions have eliminated all issues in this appeal.

The Public Auditor finds that the Purchasing Agency's concessions do not eliminate all the issues in this appeal. In fact, the Purchasing Agency states that its agreement addresses all of CTI's issues on appeal with the exception of the Appellant's claim that GDOE is required to complete a Program Study prior to the issuance of a second RFP for maintenance of Guam's remaining public schools. *Id.* In fact, the Purchasing Agency disputes this and contends that the CCIP was intended in lieu of the Program Study. Id. The Purchasing Agency goes on to argue that this issue is moot. *Id.* However, as stated above, to be moot, all issues must be resolved. As there is at least this issue for the Public Auditor to resolve, the Public Auditor finds that this matter is not moot and the Purchasing Agency's Motion to Dismiss must be DENIED.

2. The Purchasing Agency's Motion for Expedited Decision is GRANTED. The Purchasing Agency cites the SSHS's deteriorating conditions, outdated design, and overcrowding, as its justifications for requesting that this matter be expedited. Page 2, Motion to Dismiss filed on March 31, 2017. The Appellant agrees that this matter should proceed in an expedited fashion by joining in the Government's Motion for Expedited Decision. Page 2, Opposition to DPW's Motion to Dismiss filed on April 10, 2017. The laws and rules governing the procedures for resolving this appeal already require an expeditious resolution. 5 G.C.A. §5701 and 2 G.A.R., Div. 4, Chap. 12, §12101. Hence, this is an expedited proceeding. therefore, the Purchasing Agency's Motion for an Expedited Decision is hereby GRANTED.

**SO ORDERED** this 4<sup>th</sup> day of May, 2017 by:

DORIS FLORES BROOKS, CPA, CGFM

**PUBLIC AUDITOR** 

#### **Broadcast Report**

Date/Time Local ID 1 05-04-2017 6714727951 02:47:30 p.m.

Transmit Header Text Local Name 1

OFFICE OF THE PUBLIC AUDITOR

This document: Confirmed (reduced sample and details below)

Document size: 8.5"x11"

Suite 401 DNA Building 238 Archbishop Flores St. Hagåtña, Guam 96910



### **FAX**

	Mr. Glenn Leon Guerrero Director Department of Public Works	From:	Doris Flores Brooks Guam Public Auditor Office of Public Accountability		
То:	S42 North Marine Corps Drive Upper Tumon, Guam 96913 Phone: (671)646-3121/3232 Fax: (671) 649-6178  Mr. Thomas Keeter Ms. Shanuon Taltano Assistant Attorney Generals Office of the Attorney General of Guam 590 S. Marine Corps Drive, Suite 706 Tamuning, Guam, 96913 Fax: (671) 472-2493	Puges:	4 (including cover page)		
	Jøyce C.H. Tang, Esq. (Attorncy for Appellant Core Tech) Civille & Tang, P.L.C	Date:	May 4, 2017		
CC:	330 Hernan Cortez Avenue Suite 200 Hugatua, Guam 96910 Phone: (671) 472-8868/9 Fax: (671) 477-2511	Phone: Fax:	(671) 475-0390 x. 208 (671) 472-7951		
Re:	OPA-PA-17-001 Decision and Order RE Purc Expedited Decision	hasing Agency's	Motion to Dismiss and Motion for		

## □ Urgent Comments:

☐ For Review

Please acknowledge receipt of this transmittal by re-sending this cover page along with your firm or agency's receipt stamp, date, and initials of receiver.

☐ Please Comment

Thank you,
Jerrick Hernandez
Auditor
jhernandez@guamopa.cum

☐ Please Recycle

✓ Please Reply

This facsimile transmission and accompanying documents may contain confidential or privileged information. If you are not the intended recipient of this fax transmission, please call our office and notify us immediately. Do not distribute or disclose the contents to anyone. Thank you.

Total Pages Scanned: 4

Total Pages Confirmed: 12

No.	Job	Remote Station	Start Time	Duration	Pages	Line	Mode ,	Job Type	Results
001	485	6714722493	02:43:20 p.m. 05-04-2017	00:00:47	4/4	1	EC	HS	CP33600
002	485	649-6178	02:43:20 p.m. 05-04-2017	00:01:04	4/4	1	EC	HS	CP21600
003	485	671 4772511	02:43:20 p.m. 05-04-2017	00:00:44	4/4	1	EC	HS	CP33600